

Provision of Technical Assistance for Enhancing Climate Resilience and Economic Sustainability of Livestock Farming in a Rural Community of Mongolia

Deliverable:

4.3 Key Stakeholder Group Meeting – October 13, 2022

Submitted to: The United Nations

About the project

The project will strengthen climate-resilient livestock farming while deriving the economic sustainability for vulnerable herding communities in Bayantümen soum and contributing to the Nationally Determined Contributions (NDC) and national climate change adaptation and mitigation priorities for Mongolia. Alinea implements this project with the Alberta Biodiversity Monitoring Institute (ABMI) and the R&D Center for Climate Change and Sustainable Development (CCSD) in Mongolia (www.climatechange.mn).



Table of Contents

Table of Contents	1
Acronyms	2
1 Key Stakeholder Group	3
2 Stakeholder Meeting, October 13, 2022	4
2.1 Agenda & Participants	4
2.2 Minutes of Stakeholder Meeting	5
2.3 Meeting with Narangaravuu, October 17	7
Annex A. Mission Schedule	9

Under separate cover:

Materials 1: Business Models

Materials 2: Meat Plant



Acronyms

ADAPT	Adaptive Capacity (project under Green Climate Fund)
CCSD	Climate Change and Sustainable Development
CCVA	Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment
EIA	Environment Impact Assessments
GCF	Green Climate Fund
MET	Ministry of Environment and Tourism
MOFALI	Ministry of Food Agriculture and Light Industry
NDC	Nationally Determined Contributions
NEARC	North-East Asia Environmental and Agricultural Research Center
PPT	Power Point Presentation
UN	United Nations

1 Key Stakeholder Group

A key stakeholder group of 11 soum and bagh representatives was established at the end of the Bagh meeting on April 6, 2022. The group provides technical overview and a guidance throughout the project. They are directly involved in the assessment and planning through the participatory planning process. The group members take key decisions with regards to identification of the appropriate climate change adaptation and pastureland management options and guide the development and selection of community-scale business models for climate-resilient livestock farming. The group represents various soum and bagh technical and governance bodies as well as representative organizations for the poor, the elderly, women and youth. The group is 36% women. A number of the group members are herders.

Table 1: Members of the Key Stakeholders' Working Group

Name	Position	Location	Gender
1. L. Lkhagvasuren	Herder, farmer, initiator	Lake	Male
2. E. Narangarav	Soum governor	Soum center	Female
3. Gantulga	Bagh governor	4 th bagh	Male
4. Kh. Enkhbaatar	Citizen's Khural's Chairman, 4th bagh.	4 th bagh	Male
5. O. Gantumur	Member of Citizen's Khural, 4 th bagh.	Khotont - Khulstai	Male
6. E. Enkhtsetseg	Member of Citizen's Khural, 4th bagh. Leader of women's council.	Bayanbulag	Female
7. S. Jodovzagd	Member of Citizen's Khural, 4th bagh. Leader of senior people's council.	Gurvantsaidam, Gurvanii bulag	Female
8. Myagmar	Member of Citizen's Khural, 4 th bagh. Veterinarian.	Sharburd	Male
9. Zorigtbaatar	Member of Citizen's Khural, 4 th bagh. Leader of young people's council.	Khotont	Male
10. Kh. Enkhkherlen	Soum Civil Servant - Environment issues	Soum center	Female
11. B. Battugs	Soum Civil Servant- Agricultural issues	Soum center	Male
		% Female	36%

2 Stakeholder Meeting, October 13, 2022

2.1 Agenda & Participants

The Key Stakeholders meeting was held in Choibalsan City on October 13 at the end of the mission. Participants included eight members of the Key Stakeholder Group (50% female) along with 11 other organizations representatives and the project team. Excluding the project team, the representation of women at the meeting was 79%. Four people from Ulaanbaatar who were unable to travel to Dornod attended the meeting by zoom.

Table 2: Key Stakeholders' meeting - Final agenda - Choibalsan, October 13, 2022

Time	Activity	Responsible person
11:00-11:05	Opening remarks	Debra Rasmussen, Project Manager
11:05-11:25	New value chain overview of the potential project	Debra Rasmussen, Project Manager
11:25-11:45	Questions and Answers	P. Byambadorj, Facilitator-Agricultural Engineer
11:45-12:05	Conceptual design of the slaughterhouse	Wolfgang Lutz, Slaughterhouse Consultant
12:25-12:45	Questions and Answers	P. Byambadorj, Facilitator-Agricultural Engineer
12:45-13:45	Lunch	
13:45-14:05	Models	Debra Rasmussen, Project Manager
	§ Improved Pasture & herd structure	
	§ Feedlot – model and business management issues	
	§ Other	
14:05-14:25	Questions and Answers	P. Byambadorj, Facilitator-Agricultural Engineer
14:25-15:00	Wrap up and next step	Debra Rasmussen, Project Manager

Table 3: Key Stakeholder's meeting - Participants' List

No	Name	Position	Sex	Contact
1	L. Lkhagvasuren	Herder, farmer, initiator – attended online	M	99039761
2	O. Gantumur	Member of Citizen's Khural of the 4 th bagh	M	80287878
3	E. Enkhtsetseg	Member of Citizen's Khural of the 4 th bagh (leader of women's council)	F	88641052



2 Stakeholder Meeting, October 13, 2022

No	Name	Position	Sex	Contact
4	S. Jodovzagd	Member of Citizen's Khural of the 4 th bagh (leader of senior people's council)	F	89779484
5	D. Myagmar	Member of Citizen's Khural of the 4 th bagh; veterinarian	F	98666493, 89066493
6	G. Zorigtbaatar	Member of Citizen's Khural of the 4 th bagh (leader of young people's council)	M	89447911, 86823464
7	E. Narangarav	Bayantumen soum governor	F	88093779
8	Kh. Gantulga	Bayantumen soum 4th bagh governor	M	99072518
Other institutions representatives				
9	D. Narankhuu	Head of Agriculture and Animal husbandry Division	M	89681990
10	Ch. Ayushmaa	Head of Veterinary Department	F	99582004
11	B. Naran erdene	Information and training expert of Environment and tourism Department	F	89752468
12	I. Tugsmendakh	Bayantumen soum Khural speaker	M	
13	L. Khulan	Bayantumen soum land expert	F	
14	M. Manduul	Zulgen sor farm	M	80087058
15	M. Lkhagva	Secretary of Professional association	F	99135953
16	N. Bolormaa	Secretary of Professional association	F	86086888
17	Narangaravuu	Climate change Department Expert – Ministry of Environment and Tourism (MET) attended online	F	90420868
18	S. Zul	Executive Director of Climate Change and Sustainable Development (CCSD) – attended online	F	99106344
19	G. Surakhbayar	Advisor of CCSD – attended online	M	99109141
Project team members				
20	Debra Rasmussen	Project manager	F	
21	Wolfgang Lutz	Slaughterhouse expert, consultant	M	
22	P. Byambadorj	Agricultural Engineer	M	95898505
23	B. Punsalma	Translator	F	86002070
24	M. Sukhee	Driver	M	

2.2 Minutes of Stakeholder Meeting

Opening: Byambadorj introduced the purpose of the meeting.

Presentation 1: Debra Rasmussen presented the basic business model and technical feasibility approach and outcome.

Question/Answer:

- The improved herd structure was reviewed by Byamba. He asked the group if they felt the “current” “improved” model was realistic and/or feasible.
- They discussed/debated what the improved herd structure means.



2 Stakeholder Meeting, October 13, 2022

- Question: how the system of can having a baby every year match with the traditional way of every other year? Is it a good thing?
 - Byamba discussed.

Presentation 2: Wolfgang Lutz presented his analysis of the meat plant feasibility.

Questions/Comments/Discussion:

- Yes it's possible, but it's very important where the markets are. It's important to consider having a feedlot, but it takes a lot of time and effort. It's really important to find the market and who will buy the meat.
- Question: how many employees? 3 people. Some people thought this possible, others did not.
- Training: the herders should be trained in how to do this
 - You need training to do this, the boss of the company can train the workers on the job. Herders have done this for a long time and could be trained on the job.

Presentation 3: Debra Rasmussen presented the assessments of each node of the supply chain, from herder production of young stock, through feedlot, slaughterhouse, and market.

Questions/Comments/Discussion

- Lhagva – thanks the team for sharing all the findings of the study
 - Would like to say to the participants – this is for you, for Bayantumen soum and Dornod benefit. As the herders have their own animals, it's important that herders take this seriously as a food security and food safety issue as at the world level. Based on my experience in Germany and other countries in other sectors, I know that Mongolians can also run meat plants and slaughterhouses. As Debra introduced, MCS just entered and will be a big player. We will still need a local place so that everyone can participate. I think that if you have a resource, you have to do something with it. Many projects have shared information, including me. You have to think about why they are sharing this information and what we can and can't do. You have to be serious about this information. Knowing the people of Bayantumen, it think it's important to have something to be engaged in. We need to think about our children's future.

At 2:30 pm, Ms. Narangaravuu of MET joined the group by zoom to speak about the project.

- Wants to know who is participating in the meeting. Byamba explained who is participating.
- Narangaravuu introduced herself to the group and her responsibilities in the Ministry re climate change, projects, programs and the implementation of international conventions. The project is funded by the United Nations (UN) and Alinea International is the implementor. The project team has conducted several site cities and met herders and the local officials. The project is quite short and will be finished in December. The Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment (CCVA) conducted by the team under Alinea, the research and survey is quite good quality and I would like to use this model and approach in other soums of Mongolia. She thinks the questions are pretty precise and good and would be useful as a model for other soums.



Questions/Discussion:

- Question to Byamba: as a professional and Mongolian, do you think this project is feasible?
 - He thinks it's a good thing to start. It's feasible. What I like is the community level slaughterhouse vs a big one. Perhaps it could go even small to a bagh or herders cooperative together. If a herders' group did this, they should have collaboration with a crop farmer as a cluster to bring the relationship together for the feed for the feedlot. This could make it profitable and successful.
- Q: herders need to be trained. The community has a misunderstanding. They think that some herders will come into slaughter themselves and will need to be trained.
 - B: no herders will be slaughtered. That will be done by staff of the meat plant.
- Q: about 1 ha of land for the plant. Feedlot-beef 2, sheep -2, crop land about 500.
- Q: location for feedlot. then slaughter close to feedlot: Deb answered:
 - Close to feed: feeding ratio 6 to 9:1 - ship the animal to the feed, not feed to the animal
 - Water –
 - Slope of 2-8% for drainage
 - Preferred soil: clay
 - Other road access, power access,
- Q: deadline for land application is Oct 15 – Byamba clarified that this project won't put in the application.
- Vet dept: this was very useful. We need to have it and it will be a model for other soums. She understands that if someone does the feedlot, they can do the feasibility analysis and management. If someone would like to do the slaughterhouse, they can do that. There should be some people who can lead and initiate to start doing it.
- Agri: Bayantumen soum has really good access to other soums. This will allow for collection of animals.
- Q: has anyone done the soils inspection? No.
 - B: we have some info on soils gathered and will share in the final report.
- Q: Chinese doing Japanese beef at very high price. We should look at that. Also need to look after DFZ.
- Vet: of course, we have to consider the animal disease, but we can develop a compartment based on the small feedlot area. Use a holding pasture as a quarantine zone.
 - Wolfgang: is there any experience or examples of a small slaughterhouse being established in Dornod or other areas of Mongolia?
 - Jeremy's would be the only one they are aware of.

2.3 Meeting with Narangaravuu, October 17.

Debra Rasmussen and Byambadorj met with Narangaravuu on October 17 to debrief her on the mission and to discuss the timing and focus of the final mission as well as project wrap-up activities. The key points of the discussion included:

2 Stakeholder Meeting, October 13, 2022

- Similar projects addressing climate change and value chains
 - A similar project under JICA “Combatting Dzud and Climate Change” included a meat processing study in one of its components.
 - Another related project is the Adaptive Capacity (ADAPT) project under Green Climate Fund (GCF) which started in 2021.
 - It is important to maintain the private sector involvement in these market and agro-industrial developments.
- Reports
 - Narangaravuu reiterated the need for reports to be in Mongolian and English
 - Narangaravuu said she would reply to the current deliverables email by the end of the week with her approval
- Capacity Challenges
 - There are only 4 or 5 GHG experts at the national level. This puts great strain on Mongolia in terms of preparing and monitoring COP commitments
 - There is no QA/QC organization in Mongolia to support the MRV and inventory section of Nationally Determined Contributions (NDC) reporting
 - Climate change legislation is being drafted. In 2023 the Law on Climate Change will be passed. The draft legislation will be passed to Parliament this fall.
- Final mission, training activities and timing
 - During the final mission the focus will be to provide training in how to use the assessment tools developed and used during this project
 - Majid Iravani’s detailed training would be relevant to all aimags because each has an NDC focal point. They could zoom into the meeting.
 - Narangaravuu can have a contact list ready by December for the remote meeting
 - COP 27 and travel commitments
 - MET will be sending the Minister and the Representative Team to COP 27. The Director General, Narangaravuu and others will travel from November 1 to 21.
 - December 4 to 10 would be a good time for the final mission
 - Structure of the workshop
 - Main presentation should be ½ day in the hotel or MET conference room
 - Smaller, focussed trainings can be at Orient Plaza
 - Narangaravuu can share the main stakeholders list for invitation (CCRCC, Ministry of Food Agriculture and Light Industry (MOFALI) including Altangerel, Munktsetsen and Batmunkh (Ag Policy)). The State Secretary is interested in participating.

Annex A. Mission Schedule

Date	Day	Timing		Activity	Organization/ Destination	Discussion topics	Location	Remark	Contact
02-Oct	Sunday	14:00	18:00	Mission preparation			At the office	Deb, Lutz, Byambaa and Zul (Punsaa)	
03-Oct	Monday	9:00	18:00	Site visit to meat processing companies	Emeelt Market (Agro negtgel LLC)	Traditional slaughtering circumstances in Mongolia.	From Center of UB to Western side (2 ways around 40 km)	Director Mr. Nyamsuren	99119270
					Meat "Lavai" market		From Center of UB to southern side (2 ways around 10 km)	B. Dumeer Director of Lavai market. Meat whole and retail sales in UB	99091416
					Rose wood and Emart - Bucher shop in UB (Rose wood's Bucher Fritz)		Located center of UB (from office 1.5 km)	Retail sale in UB	85050135
04-Oct	Tuesday	9:00	18:00	Meeting with officials	Mongolian meat association (MMA)		At the office 9:00 am	Mr. Ochirbat (Head of MMA)	99113938
								Mr. Battogtokh (Manager of MMA)	88080174
					WB livestock commercialization project		Located center of UB (from office 1.5 km)	Mr. Vanchin (Project manager)	99112476
					IFC meat project		Located center of UB (from office 1.5 km)	Mrs. Jigjidmaa (Project manager)	99114990
					Jargalant meat processing factory (Erdenet city) representative	Meat processing issues and export-	At the office	J. Ankhbayar (Director)	99117199

Annex A: Mission Schedule

Date	Day	Timing		Activity	Organization/ Destination	Discussion topics	Location	Remark	Contact
						oriented market			
					Meat Processing factory independent consultant	Will introduce Meat processing factories current condition in Mongolia	Visit one of the Meat processing factories	Mrs. Enkhtuya (Technologist)	88066700
					Bayandelger foods LLC	Meat processing issues, feedlot and etc.	At the office	Mrs. Gantuya (Consultant) she will introduce the PPT regarding on meat processing activities	99071704
08-Oct	Saturday	9:00	17:00	Travel from UB-Khentii Overnight stay in Khentii	Khentii	Overnight stay	Chinggis hotel		70562333
09-Oct	Sunday	9:00	12:30	Travel from Khentii to Dornod	Choibalsan	Overnight stay in Choibalsan Royal hotel	Royal hotel		
				Visit to North-East Asia Environmental and Agricultural Research Center (NEARC)	Zulgen Sor Farm	Discussion and plans/options; success criteria	From Choibalsan to Zulgen Sor Farm (30 km)		99039761
10-Oct	Monday	9:00	18:00	Meeting with Dornod aimag officials	Veterinary medicine Department	Meat industry status, plan and local regulations	In Dornod aimag center	Mrs. Ch. Ayushmaa, Head of Veterinary	99582004



Annex A: Mission Schedule

Date	Day	Timing		Activity	Organization/ Destination	Discussion topics	Location	Remark	Contact
						(zoning etc); domestic and export market status, plans and issues		medicine Department	
					Agriculture and Animal husbandry Division	Food safety, SPS, traceability, inspection		Mr. D. Narankhuu, Head of Agriculture and Animal husbandry Division	89681990
					Environment and tourism Department	EIA and management requirements; standards (water and manure management)		Mr. A. Gantulga, Head of Environment and tourism Department	99080803
				Visit Dornod aimag small buchery and markets	Nomin supermarket and other	To see the market circumstances	In the center of Choibalsan		
				Site visits - Meat processing factories	Khaan Foods LLC			Mr. B. Bat-Erdene, Executive Director of Khaan Foods LLC	99098425, 91118425
					Dornod Meat LLC branch of Dornod Makh Market			Mr. T. Battur, Factory director of Dornod Meat LLC	88003841
				Meeting with Bayantumen soum officials		Meat industry status, plan and options; success criteria	In the soum center (10 km)	E. Narangarav, Governor; L.Khulan, Land expert;	
11-Oct	Tuesday	9:00	18:00	Site visits to potential	Choibalsan				

Annex A: Mission Schedule

Date	Day	Timing		Activity	Organization/ Destination	Discussion topics	Location	Remark	Contact
				site(s) near soun center					
12-Oct	Wednesday	9:00	18:00	Report and training preparation (desk work)	Choibalsan, Royal hotel	Check-out from from Zulgen Sor and check-in to Royal hotel in Choibalsan (printing)		Deb, Lutz, Byambaa and Punsaa	
13-Oct	Thursday	11:00	15:00	Stakeholder meeting	Choibalsan		Small and Medium enterprise training room	Deb, Lutz, Byambaa and Punsaa	
14-Oct	Friday	9:00	14:00	Travel from Dornod to Ulaanbaatar					
		14:00	15:00	Site visits - Meat processing factories			Jargalkhaan soun	Batbayar - Engineer and Technologist	94045197
17-Oct	Monday	9:00	18:00	Wrap up meeting	At MET		From office to MET (1.5 km)	Mrs. Narangavauu	
				Wrap-up meeting with NEARC				L. Lkhagvasuren, Director of Zulgen Sor Farm LLC	
18-Oct	Tuesday	9:00	18:00	Team briefing	At the office			Deb, Lutz, Byambaa, Surakhbayar and Zul	